Accreditation Council Eurasian Accreditation Center and quality assurance education and health

REPORT

OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF THE RESIDENTURE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME IN THE SPECIALTY 7R09138 "FAMILY MEDICINE"
OF NJSC "MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF KARAGANDA"
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION PROGRAMMES (RESIDENCE SPECIALTIES)
IN MEDICAL EDUCATION ORGANIZATIONS

period of external expert evaluation: 12.05.-14.05.2021

CONTENT

| | List of symbols and abbreviations | 2 |
|-----|--|----|
| 1. | EEC composition | 4 |
| 2. | General part of the final report of the EEC | 7 |
| 2.1 | Representation of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" (NJSC "MUK") and | 7 |
| | an educational residency programme in the specialty "Family Medicine" | |
| 2.2 | Information about previous accreditation | 8 |
| 2.3 | Analysis of the self-assessment report of the educational residency programme in | 8 |
| | the specialty "Family Medicine" | |
| 3. | Description of the stages of external expert evaluation and conclusion | 10 |
| 4. | Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an | 19 |
| | external assessment and an educational residency programme in the specialty | |
| | "Family Medicine» of NJSC "MUK" and an overview of the strengths for each | |
| | standard | |
| 5. | Recommendations for the improvement and educational programme of residency | 26 |
| | in the specialty "Family Medicine» of NJSC «MUK" | |
| 6. | Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council | 27 |
| 7. | Attachment 1. Quality profile and criteria for external assessment and educational | 28 |
| | programme of residency in the specialty "Family Medicine» of NJSC «MUK" for | |
| | compliance with ECAQA Accreditation Standards | |
| 8. | Attachment 2. List of documents studied by members of the EEC in the | 29 |
| | framework of specialized accreditation | |

LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS:

| Abbreviations and | Full name of the given designations and abbreviations |
|-------------------|---|
| symbols | This name of the given designations and desire various |
| ECTS | European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System |
| (EUA) | European Universities Association |
| ISO 9001: 2015 | ISO 9001: 2015 requirements |
| PBL | Problem-based learning |
| TBL | Team-based learning) |
| RBL | Research based learning |
| AIS | Automated information system |
| AC MUK | Academic Council IUK |
| AMP | Administrative and management personnel |
| AMEE | Association of Medical Education in Europe |
| ICC | Intra-cathedral control |
| University | Higher educational institution |
| SAC | State Attestation Commission |
| SCES | State compulsory education standard |
| DAW | Department of Academic Work |
| HRMD | Human Resource Management Department |
| DLT | Distance learning technologies |
| DAW | Department of Academic Work |
| DIID | Department of Informatization and Infrastructure Development |
| DEF | Department of Economics and Finance |
| ECAQA | Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care |
| UMSHE | Unified management system for higher education |
| FA | final examination |
| IEP | Individual educational plan |
| CC | Component of choice |
| QAC | Quality Assurance Commission |
| IMIS | Integrated medical information system |
| CED | Catalog of elective disciplines |
| MoH RK | Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan |
| MES RK | Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan |
| MEO | Medical education organization |
| MoJ RK | Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan |
| IAAR | Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating |
| NJSC "MUK" | Non-profit joint-stock company "Medical University of Karaganda" |
| RWR | Research work of a resident |
| NCIE | National Center for Independent Examination |
| STP | Scientific and technical programme |
| NLA | Regulations |

| SC | Scientific Center |
|------------|---|
| EP | Educational programme |
| AAR | Assessment of the admission rating |
| DP&CEP | Department of planning and control of the educational process |
| IA | Intermediate attestation |
| PD | Profile disciplines |
| PHC | Primary health care |
| DMP | Disease Management Programme |
| PD | Profile disciplines |
| RSE on PVC | Republican state enterprise on the right of economic management |
| WC | Working curriculum |
| EMS | Efficiency Management System |
| QMS | Quality Management System |
| SOP | Standard operating procedures |
| SOP | Operating procedure standard |
| ACAS | Academic achievement assessment system |
| RMS | Resource management system |
| SIW | Student's independent work |
| SIWT | Independent work of a student with a teacher |
| RIWT | Independent work of residents with teachers |
| SSS | Student support service |
| TC | Typical curricula |
| TVE | Technical and vocational education |
| AOSCE | Assessment of an objective structured clinical examination |
| EMA | Educational-methodical association |
| DYP | Department of Youth Policy |
| AC | Academic Council |
| CSET | Center for Simulation and Educational Technology |
| FHC | Family Health Center |

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 15 dated April 19, 2021, the External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes of the Karaganda Medical University NJSC in the period of May 12-14, 2021:



Chairperson of the External Expert Commission ERMUKHANOVA LYUDMILA SERGEEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Public health care NJSC "West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov " Tel .: +77022330465,

e-mail:aleka_2807@mail.ru



Foreign expert (online)
SULAEVA OKSANA,
PhD, Doctor of Medical Sciences,
Secretary General of the Organization of PhD Education in
Biomedical Sciences in the European Education System
(ORPHEUS), Head of the Pathology Department of the
Ukrainian Endocrinological Surgical Center for Research and
Practice, Kiev, Republic of Ukraine.
In 2012-2014. Director of PhD programmes at Donetsk
National Medical University, Member of the European Society
of Pathologists, Member of the Inflammation Research
Network of Canada.

tel .: +38 099 3809417 e-mail: oksana.sulaieva@gmail.com



National academic expert
URAZOVA SALTANAT NURGOZHAEVNA,
Doctor of Medical Sciences,
Head of the Department of Family Medicine No. 3
NJSC "Astana Medical University"
tel .: +77752248377,

e-mail:saltanat.uraz@mail.ru



National academic expert

KURMANOVA ALMAGUL MEDEUBAEVNA,

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department
clinical specialties of the Higher School of Medicine of the
Kazakh National University named after Al-Farabi, leading
researcher of JSC "Scientific Center for Obstetrics,
Gynecology and Perinatology", Almaty
Tel .:87058112598,e-mail: zulfiya-zhankalo@mail.ru



National academic expert
ZHAKYPBEKOV KAYRAT SAPARKHANOVICH,
PhD, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of
Organization, Administration and Economics of Pharmacy and
Clinical Pharmacy of NJSC Asfendiyarov KazNMU
Tel. +77479224950, e-mail: kairat_phd@mail.ru



Expert - employers' representative VITT SVETLANA VLADIMIROVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Deputy Director for Medical Work of LLP "City Center of Primary Health Care Karaganda" tel .: + 7 7013579954, e-mail: svvitt@mail.ru



Expert - resident representative (online) SHAIKHINA DINARA,

1-year resident doctor in the specialty "Anesthesiology and resuscitation, including children's" NUO "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"

tel. + 7777 8189904, e-mail:danara_1107@mail.ru



Expert - student representative ISKAKOVA SALTANAT MUKTAROVNA, 2nd year student in the specialty "Pharmacy" of the Private Institution Academy "Bolashaq" tel :: +7 701 2165065, e-mail:balken_1974@mail.ru



ECAQA Observer
UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA,
Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department
Of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality
Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care
tel :: +7 747 5609212, e-mail:info@ecaqa.org

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director general No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Family medicine" NJSC "MUK" for compliance with Accreditation Standards programmes of postgraduate education (specialty residency) of medical educational institutions of ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC on the further improvement of the educational activities of the university in the field of postgraduate education.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation of NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda" (NJSC "MUK") and an educational residency programme in the specialty "Family Medicine"

Non-profit joint stock company "Medical University of Karaganda" (hereinafter - NJSC "MUK") was established in 1950. New departments were opened every year, educational buildings, dormitories, dispensaries, recreation areas were erected. In 1959, the sanitary and hygienic faculty was opened, in 1962 the pediatric faculty was organized, in 1978 - the dental faculty. In 1966, the Central Research Laboratory was opened at the university.

AC part of the Research Center, in 2013, a shared laboratory for molecular genetic research was opened, equipped with equipment from world brands, which made it possible to conduct research at the level of international standards, AC well AC provide consultative and diagnostic services to the population. Also, in the structure of the SIC there is a research sanitary and hygienic laboratory.

In 2014, the Consultative and Diagnostic Center of the Medical University was opened, equipped with modern medical and diagnostic equipment to provide medical care to the population of the region at the level of national and international standards.

In 2018, the first student service center among medical universities was opened. The university was the first among medical schools to be admitted to the League of Academic Integrity.

In 2019, the university received the status of a Research University. I place in the rating of NPP "Atameken" was taken by the educational programmes of the University "Nursing" and "Public Health". Leadership among the medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan was determined according to the results of passing the international IFOM exam by students.

The organizational structure of the university includes 7 schools and the International Faculty of Medicine, the Center for Physical Health, the Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies (hereinafter referred to AC CST), the Center for the Development of Languages and 15 departments.

The quality of education and scientific research is ensured by a high level of infrastructure - 7 educational buildings with classrooms, a library and publishing center with reading rooms and an electronic library hall, a centralized educational center with high-tech simulators and dummies, a research center and a laboratory for collective use, a scientific research sanitary and hygienic laboratory, 7 dormitories, 57 clinical bases of the university and 15 departments, Clinic of the Medical University of NJSC "MUK", Clinic of professional health, dental clinic, Student service center, student sports and recreation camps.

Clinic of the Medical University NJSC "MUK" (hereinafter - the clinic of the Medical University - KMU) is a structural subdivision of NJSC "MUK", carrying out its activities in accordance with the state license. All clinical bases of the university are equipped with modern medical and diagnostic equipment to provide medical care to the population of the region at the level of national and international standards.

Currently, the university implements multilevel training of specialists: technical and vocational education (hereinafter referred to AC TVE), bachelor's, postgraduate (master's, doctoral, residency,) and additional education. Training is carried out in the state, Russian and English languages. The contingent of students of NJSC "MUK" AC of December 31, 2020 is 6,719 people, of which: bachelors - 4,483 people, interns - 922 people, residents - 799 people, undergraduates - 61 people, doctoral students - 72 people, students of the level TVE - 382 people

AC part of the implementation of the internationalization policy, Karaganda Medical University actively cooperates with foreign universities, research institutes, research centers, international organizations. MUK also participates in international projects and foreign programmes of academic mobility.

The history of educational activities for the training of family doctors begins with the foundations of the creation of the Department of Family Medicine. The history of the department begins on February 1, 1987, when the department of outpatient and polyclinic therapy, family medicine and emergency medical care was organized. In subsequent years, the department underwent reorganization. The Department of Family Medicine was created on the basis of the departments of general medical

practice No. 1 and No. 2 in accordance with the order of the Chairperson of the Board of NJSC "MUK" in September 2019-2020 academic year by merging them.

General number of students in residency NJSC "MUK" in 2020-2021 years is 779 residents, including in the specialty "Family medicine" 143 people.

Thus, NJSC "MUK" is a research-oriented university in the Republic of Kazakhstan. The university is one of the leading medical universities in Kazakhstan for the training of qualified personnel for the health care system, which plays an important role in the provision of educational, scientific, medical and diagnostic services. The university carries out multilevel training of competitive health care professionals in the field of family medicine, through the implementation of a competence-based model of medical education, with the widespread involvement of domestic and foreign scientists and a constant increase in scientific potential.

In the specialty 7R09138 "Family medicine", the first enrollment was made in the 2019-2020 academic year, the first graduation of residents is planned in 2021.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Accreditation of the educational residency programme by specialty "Family Medicine" until now has not been carried out.

2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the residency study programme specialties Family Medicine

Self-assessment report educational programme presented on 145 pages of main text, separately 72 annexes, and electronic versions of documents by link to google drive.

The report is characterized by completeness of responses to 8 accreditation standards, structuredness based on the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, and internal consistency of information provided by the accredited family medicine programme. The report is accompanied by a cover letter signed by the rector of NJSC "MUK" Professor R.S. Dosmagambetova, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of NJSC "MUK" responsible for the self-assessment of educational programmes - Abugalieva Tleuzhan Orazalievna, head of the Department of Family Medicine, doctor of the highest category...

Working group in the amount of 6 people headed by the chairperson T.O. Abugalieva. Some work was done to prepare the self-assessment report: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffs, educational resources were analyzed, the necessary information was collected in accordance with the Accreditation Standards for postgraduate education programmes (residency specialties) of ECAQA medical educational institutions (hereinafter -accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of the strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

All standards show actual practice NJSC "MUK" for the training of residents in the specialty "Family medicine "taking into account the beginning of the admission of students in 2019 and 2020., reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The self-assessment report description fairly completed and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans and improvement, etc...

Conclusion on each of the 8 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified through introspection and development prospects for the specialty. Compliance analysis is given only according to 8 standards, since new educational residency

programmes are presented for the examination and the process of continuous improvement (standard 9) will be analyzed and evaluated at the stage of post-accreditation monitoring when the Accreditation Council makes a decision on the full accreditation of the educational programme...

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited educational residency programme of NJSC MUK contains objective, detailed, structured information on all types of activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made the appropriate corrections in the report at the stage of expert evaluation.

2.4 Overall assessment of the residency study programme in the specialty "Family Medicine" for compliance with the Standards of accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (specialty residency) of medical educational organizations.

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by external experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards and the recommendations of the Self-Assessment Guidelines, at the same time, following the expert evaluation recommendations were made for adjustments, which were taken into account by the working group.

The report is written sequentially in compliance with the logic in the description of the standards, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

The report recommended making changes and additions to some standards (standard 1, standard 3, standard 4, standard 5, standard 6)...

The self-assessment and description were carried out in accordance with the criteria of the ECAQA accreditation standards and the questions formulated in the Self-Assessment Guidelines were answered. All standards show actual practice of NJSC "MUK" for the preparation of residents by specialty - "Family Medicine" taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2019, 2020, well-reasoned data, examples of the implementation of the tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. The self-assessment report description fairly completed and updated in terms of the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the 8 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified through introspection and development prospects for the specialty.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited educational residency programme of NJSC MUK contains objective, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made the appropriate corrections in the report at the expert evaluation stage.

3. Description of external expert evaluation

External expert work on the evaluation of the educational programme residency in the specialty "Family medicine "was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting an external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director general of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on May 11 .2021 Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the Chairperson of the Board of NJSC "MUK" Dosmagambetova R.S.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the members of the EEC used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with residents, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and residents, review of resources

in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of regulatory and educational-methodological documents both before the visit to NJSC "MUK", and during the visit.

The staff of NJSC "MUK" ensured the presence of all persons indicated in the Visiting Programme and according to the lists of interview participants.

The sequence of the visit within 3 days is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is in the documentation of the accreditation center and in the annex to this report.

The first day of the visit is 05/12/21.

On the first day of the visit to NJSC "MUK", the first meeting was held with the Chairperson of the Board - Rector Dosmambetova RS. There was a presentation of the EEC members, familiarization with the goals of the visit The rector made a presentation on the activities of the university and answered questions. In particular, she announced the strategic plans of the university, which has the status of research and development and cooperates with universities in Japan, Lithuania, Russia, Georgia. The mission and main goals were voiced: interaction between science, practice and education, the involvement of teachers in the clinic, the involvement of practicing doctors, primarily AC mentors, their involvement in scientific activities and other tasks. The interview dealt with the issues of the development strategy of postgraduate education. High employment of university graduates was noted. Many questions were asked about field practice in the regions, about the work of mentors, etc. In connection with the pandemic, questions were asked about the provision of residents with PPE. Because The teaching staff and resident doctors 100% work in medical organizations AC part-time workers, they are provided with PPE completely at clinical bases.

Then a meeting with Vice-Rector for Academic Affairs V.P. Ricklefs took place. The issues on risks and risk management of the implementation of educational programmes were covered; openness and transparency of the EP; mechanisms of discussion of the EP and stages of approval. It was noted that each EP has a leader, a working group. Then, after writing and discussing the EP, it is submitted to the School Council, approved by the dean, vice-rector. Each school has a quality committee that analyzes and makes recommendations. Earlier, the EP was approved by the Academic Council, now it is being discussed in the Education Commission under the Senate.

In an interview with Vice-Rector for Strategic Development and Science Turmukhambetova A.A. issues of development prospects and scientific directions of the university were discussed. In particular, the vice-rector announced that the university is implementing 19 grants from the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, a dissertation council in the specialty "Medicine" is functioning, employees are published in peer-reviewed journals.

Vice-rector for clinical work Kosherova B.N. told that the university has its own 3 clinics and cooperates with all clinical bases, where teaching staff and resident doctors work AC part-time workers. In addition, hands-on sessions with residents are taught by experienced clinical mentors from practical health care. The university has contracts with honey, organizations of the region.

A conversation was held with the executive secretary of the selection committee K. Toleubekov, who spoke about the rules for admission to the university, attracting foreign students to training.

The interview with the deans of the schools concerned the formation of the state order for EP, admission to residency, assessment policy, resource provision, monitoring of graduates' employment. Dean of the School of Residency and Professional Development of Tashkenbaeva V.B. She spoke about approaches to attracting employees of clinical bases for teaching residents, about the strategy and tactics of recruiting residents for different specialties, information security of postgraduate education. The experts asked questions about the preparation of individual plans, the length of the working day, the requirements for mentors, etc.

Further, an interview was held with the heads of educational programmes on planning, monitoring implementation, assessment policy, resource availability, assessment of educational programmes, satisfaction with the quality of graduates' training.

In addition, a meeting was held with the leadership of other structural divisions: Head of Human Development resources department, chairpersons of dissertation councils, the Commission on Quality Assurance in Schools, staff of the Department of Academic Work. Various issues were discussed with

the heads of structural divisions regarding the provision of resources, the procedure and information about the procedure for defending theses, the procedure for approving the EP, the study of IT resources for the EP, the distance learning platform, the maintenance of electronic journals, etc.

When visiting the student service center, the commission was familiarized with the implementation of information systems, servicing students.

Then the experts visited the library and publishing center. Director Amirova Ya.O. acquainted with the structure and work of the library, answered questions about the availability of literature for residency programmes. A distinctive feature is the electronic book supply of students, which is important in the period of distance learning. Also, the library has access to international databases and the provision of electronic resources such AC, for example: Cochrane Library; Web of Science; Scopus, etc. These resources allow residents, teachers to fully use them in practical and research work.

Thus, an interview with the management and key employees of KazNMU made it possible to determine the fulfillment of most of the criteria for accreditation standards 1,2,5,7,8, namely, to identify approaches in developing the mission of the educational programme and its compliance with the strategic goals of the university, the role and place of postgraduate education on the clinical direction in the strategy of the university (plan), mechanisms in determining the appropriate specialties of residency of clinical sites and qualified teachers.

Residents were interviewed to validate the performance of the self-assessment report and to obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes. 39 residents attended. The experts asked questions about satisfaction with studying at the university, sufficient time for practical training, supervision of patients and work with medical records, AC well AC satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers. In general, residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this university, since they believe that the NJSC AMU has an excellent reputation and experience in teaching residents. Residents believe that they will receive a good education and will be able to work independently after graduating from the university. Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts,

Results of the survey.

On May 12, 2021, an observer from ECAQA conducted an online survey of students of the Medical University of Karaganda on the resource https://webanketa.com/...

Results of the survey of students:

Total number of respondents - 48...

Of the total number of respondents, residents of the 2nd education prevailed - 31.25%, then according to the list: doctoral students - 25%, residents of the 1st education - 20.83%, residents of the 3rd year of education - 16.67%, students - bachelors - 4.17% and undergraduates - 2.08%.

According to the answers:

Will recommend this university AC an educational organization - 87.5% fully agree, partially 12.5%. 89.58% of respondents fully agree and 10.42% partially agree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their learning problems. Programme managers and teachers involve students in the work of advisory bodies (methodological council, academic council, committees of educational programmes): constantly - 87.5%, no - 2.0%, do not know about this issue - 4.17%, doubt - 2, 08%, sometimes - 4.17%. Fully (97.92%) and partially (2.08%) are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms and classrooms of the university. 97.92% of respondents agree with the statement that this organization has created conditions for rest and meals for students (rest rooms, benches on the territory, canteen), 2.08% disagree. According to 95, 83% (in full) and 4.17% (in part) office equipment is available to residents at practice bases. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - 97.92% fully agree, partially - 2.08%. With the statement that the organization of education has access to the participation of students in research work, 95.83% fully agree, and 4.17% partially. Fully - 97.92% of students are satisfied with the library fund and resources, and 2.08% consider themselves unsatisfied in this matter. 97.92% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources and 2.08% believe that it is

partially. 93.75% of students believe that they have full access to medical services, 4.17% are not partially satisfied, and from 2.08% there is no answer. 17% (partially) office equipment is available for residents at practice bases. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - 97.92% fully agree, partially - 2.08%. With the statement that the organization of education has access to the participation of students in research work, 95.83% fully agree, and 4.17% partially. Fully - 97.92% of students are satisfied with the library fund and resources, and 2.08% consider themselves unsatisfied in this matter. 97.92% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources and 2.08% believe that it is partially. 93.75% of students believe that they have full access to medical services, 4.17% are not partially satisfied, and from 2.08% there is no answer. 17% (partially) office equipment is available for residents at practice bases. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - 97.92% fully agree, partially - 2.08%. With the statement that the organization of education has access to the participation of students in research work, 95.83% fully agree, and 4.17% partially. Fully - 97.92% of students are satisfied with the library fund and resources, and 2.08% consider themselves unsatisfied in this matter. 97.92% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources and 2.08% believe that it is partially. 93.75% of students believe that they have full access to medical services, 4.17% are not partially satisfied, and from 2.08% there is no answer. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes - 97.92% fully agree, partially - 2.08%. With the statement that the organization of education has access to the participation of students in research work, 95.83% fully agree, and 4.17% partially. Fully -97.92% of students are satisfied with the library fund and resources, and 2.08% consider themselves unsatisfied in this matter. 97.92% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources and 2.08% believe that it is partially. 93.75% of students believe that they have full access to medical services, 4.17% are not partially satisfied, and from 2.08% there is no answer. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes -97.92% fully agree, partially - 2.08%. With the statement that the organization of education has access to the participation of students in research work, 95.83% fully agree, and 4.17% partially. Fully -97.92% of students are satisfied with the library fund and resources, and 2.08% consider themselves unsatisfied in this matter. 97.92% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources and 2.08% believe that it is partially. 93.75% of students believe that they have full access to medical services, 4.17% are not partially satisfied, and from 2.08% there is no answer. that in the organization of education there is access to the participation of students in research work, 95.83% fully agree, in part - 4.17%. Fully - 97.92% of students are satisfied with the library fund and resources, and 2.08% consider themselves unsatisfied in this matter. 97.92% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources and 2.08% believe that it is partially. 93.75% of students believe that they have full access to medical services, 4.17% are not partially satisfied, and from 2.08% there is no answer. that in the organization of education there is access to the participation of students in research work, 95.83% fully agree, in part - 4.17%. Fully - 97.92% of students are satisfied with the library fund and resources, and 2.08% consider themselves unsatisfied in this matter. 97.92% of respondents have access to electronic educational resources and 2.08% believe that it is partially. 93.75% of students believe that they have full access to medical services, 4.17% are not partially satisfied, and from 2.08% there is no answer. 08% believe that it is partially. 93.75% of students believe that they have full access to medical services, 4.17% are not partially satisfied, and from 2.08% there is no answer. 08% believe that it is partially. 93.75% of students believe that they have full access to medical services, 4.17% are not partially satisfied, and from 2.08% there is no answer.

95.83% of respondents are fully satisfied with the activities of mentors, curators and scientific advisers, and 4.17% are partially satisfied. In the opinion of 95.83%, the teachers and employees of the organization treat the students with respect, however 4.17% do not agree with this statement. On the question of the existence and implementation of student support programmes, 95.83% agree, have not heard of such programmes - 2.08%, there is no answer from 2.08%. 85.42% of students are aware of

the existence of a student career counseling service, 8.33% have not heard about it and 6.25% expressed doubts about the answer.

100% agree that the university has established a system of self-study for students of all levels. The organization of clinical (practical) training, according to 79.17%, fully satisfies them AC excellent, and 20.83% described it AC good.

89.58% of respondents fully, and 10.42% - partially agree with the question that there is sufficient time for practical training. All 100% of students satisfy the schedule of training sessions in EP disciplines. Satisfied with the methods of assessing knowledge and skills - fully 91.67%, partially - 8.33%. 91.67% answered that the content of the EP (list of disciplines) in the chosen specialty fully meets their expectations, and 8.33% - partially.

In the opinion of 95.83%, teachers in the classroom use active and interactive teaching methods on a regular basis, and in the opinion of 4.17% - sometimes. 100% answered that teachers were never late for the start of classes. 91.67% completely, 4.17% partially satisfied with a sufficient number of patients for supervision or assistance during operations, 4.17% did not give an answer.

According to 100% of respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after the end of classes. For 91.67% of students, a teacher (mentor, curator) is an example AC a professional doctor, a person, but 8.33% believe that not all teachers meet this characteristic.

91.67% like to study at this university, and 8.33% partially agree with this statement. 97.92% are completely satisfied that they are studying at this university, partially - 2.08%. Relationships with fellow students, colleagues, and medical staff are completely satisfied with 97.92%, partially - 2.08%. 97.92% of students did not experience a negative attitude from teachers, 2.08% answered that it happened, but deservedly.

All respondents (100%) believe that the leadership of the organization is quite accessible to students. When asked whether you are currently engaged in research work, 89.58% answered positively, 4.17% - no, 2.08% plan to start, and 4.17% are looking for research and development. A question was also asked about the printed works published personally during the training in this organization: 47.92% answered that one work was printed, 41.67% - more than one, 2.08% - none, 6.25% plan to publish in the near future, 2.08% have just entered the training programme.

All 100% of the respondents believe that the university allows you to acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty. Also, all 100% are completely satisfied with the organization of teaching.

97.92% had a positive opinion about the work of the EEC on accreditation, 2.08% doubted the answer. 91.67% believe that it is necessary to carry out accreditation of an organization or EP, 2.08% - that there is no need, 2.08% do not know what it is, and 4.17% doubted the answer. 75% answered that the teachers involved them in preparations for accreditation, in particular, at the stage of drawing up a self-assessment report, 2.08% - to organize a meeting of external experts, 8.33% - at all stages of preparation, 4.17% answered in the affirmative, tk. speak a foreign language, 6.25% answered that they were not involved.

Conclusions: with their answers, most of the students of 5 educational programmes are completely satisfied with the organization of training, relationships with teachers, the attitude of the university administration towards them, and the availability of educational resources. More than 95% of respondents highly rated the hands-on training and teaching methods used by the teachers. In general, the university has a corporate spirit and student support. At the same time, some of the respondents have complaints about equipping classrooms and classrooms, and not all students know about the work of the employment center and graduates' careers.

The work of the external expert commission of the accreditation center was highly appreciated and the respondents had an understanding of the need for accreditation AC a procedure for ensuring the quality of higher and postgraduate education.

Interviews with alumni took place on doctoral programmes. Because there was no graduation in family medicine residency, and no interviews with resident alumni took place.

The experts studied in detail the documentation, including the progress and attendance journals, work curricula, syllabuses, control and measuring instruments, examination sheets. At the end of the day, EEC meetings were held, discussion of the results.

The second day of the visit is 11/19/2020.

This day was devoted to visiting clinical sites for the implementation of residency programmes. At clinical sites, experts surveyed the resources of the accredited educational programme, their compliance with residency training courses, accessibility for teachers and residents, how modern this equipment is and meets the needs of students and practical health care.

Accreditation of the educational programme in the specialty "Family Medicine" attended PSE "Polyclinic No. 3 of Karaganda".

The clinical base of the PSE "Polyclinic No. 3 of Karaganda" is to a competitive medical and prophylactic enterprise staffed with highly qualified specialists using modern innovative and managerial technologies that provide the citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan with high quality medical services.

The polyclinic was organized by combining 4 family medical outpatient clinics of the South-East region in 2004. A new four-storey, five-block building located in the Gulder microdistrict was commissioned in January 2009. The total area is over 12,500 m². The equipment of the enterprise with medical equipment is 88%.

The head of the polyclinic is Burankulova Sania Nurtasovna.

In the provision of medical care, innovative programmes of the health care system are actively used in practice, including the Integrated Management of Childhood Illness, Safe Pregnancy Protection. There are health schools: Bronchial Asthma, Ischemic Heart Disease, Arterial Hypertension, Family Planning, Diabetes Mellitus, Healthy Child. Assistants, associate professors, professors of the departments of Karaganda State Medical University, based on the territory of the organization, participate in the process of providing medical care to the attached population.

The organizational structure includes 4 Family Health Centers, departments: consultative and diagnostic, surgical with the Center for Outpatient Surgery and Gynecology, obstetric and gynecological, prevention department with newly introduced rates of psychologists, social workers in 2011, day hospital for 60 beds.

The clinic is equipped with modern medical equipment. The following successfully operate on the basis of the polyclinic: a youth health center; a stroke center, to provide advice to the population on the prevention of the development of complications of diseases of the cardiovascular system; a center for active longevity; the center of high technologies of laboratory diagnostics is located in the polyclinic. Some of the production rooms are highlighted: RSE "Regional ambulance station"; the city warehouse of vaccines. There are 2 elevators for seriously ill patients and for parents with children.

Estimated capacity of 1000 visits per shift. The number of employees is 140 doctors and 208 paramedical workers with the highest, first, and second qualification categories.

IN PSE "Polyclinic No. 3 of Karaganda" has 2 study rooms of the Department of Family Medicine and a lecture hall. In this clinical base, 14 residents specializing in "Family Medicine" work in practice under the guidance of clinical mentors - Isatayeva Sholpan Kudaibergenovna, deputy. director for quality control and examination of medical services, doctor of the first category and Azanbaeva Aigul Kataevna, deputy. director for treatment and prophylactic work, doctor of the highest category.

On this base, experts talked with 7 residents who are at a practical lesson on the discipline "Differential diagnosis of internal diseases" on the topic "Arterial hypertension". Also, a meeting was held with the clinical mentor Isatayeva Sh.K.

The experts obtained evidence of compliance with accreditation standards 2 and 6, AC well AC validation of the information in the self-assessment report of the educational programme.

A resource review showed that the clinical base of SPE on REM "City Polyclinic No. 3" is the center of the best practices and correspond to the goals and objectives of the accredited educational

programme in terms of the profile of beds, the number of thematic patients, modern equipment and its availability to all students, and the department staff ensure collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, the leadership of the clinical base to achieve the final results of the educational programme. Before the start of the corresponding discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during training.

Also on the same day, interviews with teachers and employers (representatives of practical health care) took place. It is necessary to take into account the fact that there was no graduation in the accredited educational programme yet, so it was not possible to interview the graduates.

In interviews with the teachers of the departments, questions were asked about almost all standards - the mission and goals of the university, the introduction of innovative teaching methods in the educational process, advanced training, the implementation of research, academic mobility of teachers and residents, clinical bases, mentoring, assessment of the work of residents, etc.

Interviews with teachers, AC providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, depending on the specific clinical base (access of residents to equipment, a sufficient number of thematic patients, time for maintaining medical records, independent work of residents) ... The experts received answers about the teacher training programme, the financing of this training, the availability of certification in teaching methods for teachers.

In parallel, a survey of teachers was carried out.

Results of the survey of teachers of NJSC MUK:

The total number of teachers on the list is 27. The total number of respondents is 39, including those with work experience of up to 5 years - 3.7%, 5-10 years - 7.41%, over 10 years - 88.89%. Of these, the majority (37.04%) are residency teachers, 18.52% are medicine, doctoral studies, 14.81% are pharmacy / TPP (bachelor's degree), 11.11% represent management in health care facilities, master's programmes, 7.41% each - other areas of magistracy and bachelor's degree and 3.7% - doctoral education in public health.

According to the answers:

Fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process - 74.07%, partially - 22.22%, did not receive an answer from 3.7%. At the university, ethics and subordination are observed - 92.59% fully agree, and 7.41% partially.

Fully satisfied with the organization of work and workplace - 74.07% of respondents, partially - 25.93%. The organization has an opportunity for career growth and competence development for teachers - 92.59% fully agree, 3.7% partially, 3.7% completely disagree.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 81.48% fully agree, 14.81% partially, and 3.7% completely disagree. 51.85% of the teaching staff answered that they were satisfied with the salary, 40.74% answered - more YES than NO, 3.7% each - more NO than YES and there is no answer. 74.07% of the respondents were fully satisfied with the work of the personnel department, 14.81% were partially satisfied, 3.7% were partially dissatisfied, 7.41% doubted the answer. The majority of the respondents had undergone advanced training for the last 5 years (74.07%).

77.78% of the teaching staff believe that the discipline they teach is provided with sufficient resources, 11.11% partially agree and 7.41% partially disagree with this statement.

The majority - 85.19% - completely agree that they can be realized AC professionals. 70.37%, i.e., the majority actively participated in the development of EP in the discipline taught, 14.81% did not participate, and 7.41% were only electives. The absolute majority of 77.78% of respondents believe that applications for the purchase of office equipment, stationery, etc. are being fulfilled in a timely manner.

When asked whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and national conferences, 33% answered that the help consists in paying for travel, travel expenses, registration fee, 11% help is paying for travel, another 11% believe that the university does not pay for

any expenses. 26% did not address this to the management or relevant administrative staff of the university, and 15% did not give an answer. The majority of respondents (74%) fully agree, and 19% partially agree that students have free access to patients and clinic resources.

The teachers assessed their publication activity on a scale of 5 points: almost half (48%) answered that they rate it at 4 points, 40% did not receive an answer, 18% answered each with a score of 3 and 5.

63% of respondents are aware of the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 30% do not know about it and doubt about their existence, 8% of respondents. The leaders of the organization systematically listen to the opinion of the teachers - 52%, sometimes - 26% of the respondents.

When teaching residents, a variety of teaching methods are used, but more often - work in small groups -74.07%, analysis of situational tasks (74%), problem-oriented learning (63%), written assignments - 59.26%, interactive learning - 56%, oral questioning and analysis of the topic (52%), also lectures (48%), implementation of projects, term papers, solution of tests and oral questioning (44% each), compilation and solution of cases (41%), practical exercises on clinical skills in the UCC (26%), the implementation of essays (19%).

The majority of the teaching staff (63%) fully and 26% partially agree that this survey is useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the university's activities. 44% answered that they were included in the internal self-assessment commission, 37% collected information for attachments to the self-assessment report, 30% wrote sections of the self-assessment report. 33% expressed a desire to become an ECAQA accreditation expert, 40% doubted the answer. The majority -70% - believe that the work of the EEC on accreditation can fully cover all issues related to the quality of implementation of the EP of the university, because The visit of the commission is preceded by a stage of self-assessment of the programme and writing a report, 52% think so, because the commission examines all the main processes of implementation of programmes, 48% - because the commission's programme includes interviews and interviews with stakeholders, allowing to draw conclusions about the quality of training, 41% - because the programme of the commission's visit is rich and covers all key aspects of education, according to 37%, everything depends on the professionalism and competence of accreditation experts. Of the activities of external expert work on accreditation, the most important and allowing to obtain evidence of compliance with the Accreditation Standards - 15% each noted an interview with the leadership of the university and with the heads of the EP, 11% - with the graduates of the programmes, 7% - with the students and 37% consider all aspects to be important.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the attachment and, in general, demonstrate the positive aspects of training in residency programmes.

Conclusions: the survey showed that more than 2/3 of the respondents are satisfied with the organization of the educational process at the university and the majority have the opportunity to engage in research and development. At the same time, more than a quarter of the respondents underwent advanced training more than 5 years ago. It was determined that only 2/3 believe that the discipline they teach is fully provided with appropriate and sufficient resources and that students have free access to the resources of practice bases. It is alarming that almost 40% of the respondents could not assess their publication activity in any way and do not know about the social programmes to support teachers existing at the university.

Almost half of the respondents doubt that their opinion is taken into account by the university administration and only 63% believe that the results of this survey can be useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of the university's activities...

Thus, areas for improvement have been identified: improving the qualifications of teachers in pedagogy, teaching methods; increasing the publication activity of teachers and supporting the university in this matter; informing teachers about social support programmes.

Interview with employers who are not affiliated with the university conducted online for all educational programmes declared for accreditation and included such issues AC: knowledge of the

university's mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the deliberative bodies of NJSC MUK, satisfaction with basic knowledge and skills of students, participation in training residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of residency graduates, etc. In general, employers positively characterize mutual work with the university, are satisfied with the level of training of the residents and believe that such work is beneficial for both the university and medical institutions.

The third day of the visit 05/14/2021

On the third day, experts visited the Center for Simulation and Educational Technologies (CSET)... CSET of NJSC "MUK" carries out preclinical work on the development and delivery of practical skills by residents on dummies and virtual simulators. In 2019-2020 account, year, all residents of the 1st course were trained to consolidate practical skills in the Center for Social and Social Technologies. Many residents in Portfolio have photographs from classes on working with dummies. Improving the material and technical support of the DHS is one of the priority areas of the university's activities. The high level of equipment of the DHS with modern equipment allows residents to professionally develop practical skills that can be useful to them in their practical activities. The staff of the TSOT includes professional trainers who conduct training and practice practical skills with students at all levels of education.

During the interview with the compliance officer, issues of implementation of anti-corruption policy, monitoring of corruption risks, observance of academic integrity by employees and students were discussed.

Documentation reviewed Department of Family Medicine, provided by the link in google drive and demanded additionally. The study of the documentation confirmed compliance with accreditation standards (nomenclature of the department's affairs, plan for 5 years, annual plan for 2019-2020 academic year, report for 2019, journal of residents' progress, EMCD, feedback questionnaires with residents, teachers, reports on the results questionnaires and measures taken, code of ethics, control and measuring instruments, etc.), including documentation at the request of EEC members.

Then a meeting of the EEC members took place following the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC began to design the final report of the EEC.

EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. "The quality profile and the criteria for external assessment of the NIC for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of the residency programme in medical educational institutions of ECAQA" is individually filled by experts Recommendations for improving education in general and the department implementing the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

The EEC Chairperson held a final open vote on recommendations for NJSC MUK and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council.

Then the Chairperson of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment AC part of the accreditation of educational programmes.

Conclusion on the basis of the external evaluation:

Members EECs are carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, implementation of the activities of the visit programme of NJSC MUK was analyzed. All the information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to make sure of the reliability of the information provided by the university and supporting documents for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

Despite the fact that in the self-assessment report of the educational programme of the NJSC MUK described his best practice on adherence to accreditation standards, during an external expert evaluation by EEC members studied documentation, learning resources videos, which made it possible to identify the conformity of the activity educational organizations Accreditation standards...

Recommendations for improving performance in the field implementation of the educational residency programme in the specialty <u>Family Medicine</u> for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on May 14, 2021.

The programme and schedule of the external expert assessment of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the university staff, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational residency programme in specialty "Family Medicine" of NJSC "MUK" and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

Standard 1: MISSION AND END OUTCOMES

The mission of the Family Medicine residency study programme is based on the quality policy of NJSC MUK and the Strategic Plan. The educational programme is posted on the link to <u>university website</u>... The definition of the mission of the EP is based on the "Code of Public Health and the Health care System of the Republic of Kazakhstan", "State Programme for the Development of Health care of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2020-2025", <u>Code of Academic Integrity</u>, Code of Business Conduct of NJSC MUK.

The mission of the educational programme defines the position of the university on "training highly qualified competitive health care professionals", reflecting the educational strategy and the concept of reforming medical and pharmaceutical education in the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Mission of the educational programme in the specialty "Family medicine" is aimed at realizing the mission of the University by training a qualified doctor - a specialist in family medicine, possessing a system of universal knowledge and professional competencies, capable and ready for independent professional activity.

The mission of the educational programme was brought to the attention of all employees of departments, residents and the public by posting on the university website.

To improve all areas of the university's activities, including the mission, the university has introduced a system for collecting and analyzing feedback from consumers through internal and external monitoring.

The materials of the report adequately describe the process of developing a mission, vision and strategy based on an analysis of the real positioning of the university and their focus on meeting the needs of the state, society, students and employers.

Family medicine is taught at the largest and most advanced clinics. This contributes to the acquisition of good clinical practice by the residents, the ability to think independently and, after graduation, to be able to work independently at a high professional level.

Proof of achievement of the mission objectives is the graduation of competitive university graduates. This was confirmed by interviews with employers (selection of graduates of NJSC "MUK"), residents (motivation to enter the university).

In addition, when studying in residency, the goal is to attract students to conduct scientific and clinical research. However, during interviews and visits to clinical sites, it turned out that residents have a fragmented understanding of the conduct of research. Although all students are involved in research and scientific research.

In addition, during interviews with employers, there was no clear answer about the awareness of the mission, goals and final results of the EP in residency. However, upon a more detailed questioning, it turned out that everyone has sufficient information.

Strengths:

- 1) Resident training at large clinics
- 2) Highly professional staff
- 3) Entering the "League of Academic Integrity"
- 4) Developed and actively involved in the work of the Code of Academic Integrity, Code of Business Ethics
- 5) Active cooperation with strategic partners

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 17 standards conform: completely - basic standard (BS) - 9, improvement standard (IS) - 4, significantly - BS -1, IS-3, partially -0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No recommendation.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES

According to this standard, materials were provided via a link in a google drive. In addition, upon additional request, additional documents were provided that are at the department - reports, department plans, EMCD and others. Information was also obtained during interviews and visits to clinical sites.

For the effective implementation of the educational programme, internal regulatory documents have been developed that regulate the organization of the educational process at the University. All of them are based on the guidance documents of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the organization of the educational process.

Residency training in the specialty "7R01124 - Family medicine" in NJSC "MUK" is planned, organized and implemented in accordance with the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2015 and TC for medical specialties of residency. EP in the specialty "Family Medicine" is developed taking into account the modular technology of education. The programme provides for the mastering of the modules "Family Medicine", "Internal Medicine", "Comprehensive Practice of a Family Doctor", "Surgery", "Health of women and children".

To ensure the quality of education and improve the assessment system in the process of distance learning, conduct intermediate attestation at the university, a proctoring system has been introduced, AC well AC checking all written works of students for uniqueness through detection systems (Turnitin) borrowing text from other authors...

In the process of training residents in the specialty "Family Medicine" at NJSC "MUK" to improve the efficiency of the mentoring system, to achieve professional competence, clinical mentors are actively involved in the work. An important feature of the educational programme is its focus on practical health care. At the end of the academic year, the resident provides a report on the achievement of the necessary competencies, which, along with maintaining a portfolio, increases independence and responsibility for the timely development of competencies.

For the discipline "Family Medicine", educational-methodical complexes of disciplines (EMCD) have been developed, which include: syllabus; control and measuring equipment; a map of the

educational and methodological provision of the discipline; forms of reporting documentation on duty. Paper and electronic versions of the EMCD are available at the department.

Strengths:

- 1) Application of a credit-modular system and an integrated learning approach in the preparation of residents.
- 2) Updating and updating the catalog of elective disciplines
- 3) Resident work with real patients in various clinical settings
- 4) Availability of a sufficient number of clinical sites and clinical mentors
- 5) Participation of representatives of practical health care in the preparation of work programmes.

*Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. C*orrespond out of 30 standards: completely - basic standard (BS) - 20, improvement standard (IS) - 5, significantly - BS -2, IS-3, partially -0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Provide in educational programmes for training residents in the management of scientific research, medical statistics, health care organization AC a component of their choice

Standard 3: EVALUATION OF RESIDENTS

Confirmation of the implementation of this standard is presented at the link in google drive, where the relevant documents are presented and reasoned in interviews conducted and when visiting the clinical bases of the department.

Resident assessment policies and methods are reviewed and approved at a meeting of the Quality Assurance Commission at the School of Residency and Professional Development.

The system of monitoring the educational achievements of residents in NJSC "MUK" includes: current and midterm monitoring of progress, intermediate certification of residents and final state certification. The organization of the system for monitoring the educational achievements of residents is carried out by the Office of the Registrar in the Department of Academic Work.

Ongoing supervision is carried out by the teacher / clinical mentor. The forms and content of the current control are determined by the syllabus for the discipline. The educational achievements of residents are assessed using a point-rating letter system. Midterm control evaluates the learning outcomes upon completion of the discipline sections. Based on the results of midterm controls, the rating of admission to the final control in the discipline is calculated. The final control in the discipline is determined by the assessment of the final learning outcomes and is reflected in the syllabus.

Intermediate certification of residents is carried out in accordance with the academic calendar, working curriculum and educational programmes developed on the basis of the State Educational Standard of Education and standard curricula of residency specialties.

Intermediate certification of residents at NJSC "MUK" is carried out in the form of a 3-stage exam in modules / disciplines - stage 1 - clinical examination (certification of practical skills) (30%), stage 2 - portfolio defense (40%), stage 3 - written exam or computer testing (30%). The written exam is held on the session.kgmu.kz platform with the verification of the resident's written answer for originality in the Turnitin system, AC well AC with the coding of the residents' work, ensuring the objectivity of the assessment. The clinical examination is carried out in the form of attestation of practical skills "at the patient's bedside", protection of the portfolio according to the assessment sheet.

The final certification of residents is carried out according to the forms established by the State Educational Standard of Education and the EP of residency...

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Model Curriculum. The final control includes 2 stages: integrated computer testing, assessment of the level of mastering practical skills. The assessment is carried out according to the developed checklists. To carry out the final certification of residents, a state certification commission is created. In case of disagreement with the results of the

rating of the final control, final certification in discipline, a resident has the right to submit an appeal to the chairperson of the appeal commission.

Strengths:

- 1) Standardized Approaches to Measuring Learning Outcomes
- 2) High-quality formation and examination of control and measuring instruments
- 3) Automation of the assessment of the learner using the information system Platonus, programmes session.kgmu.kz
- 4) Portfolio filling by each resident
- 5) Compliance with the principles of academic honesty and objectivity of assessment

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Conform out of 11 standards: completely - basic standard (BS) - 6, improvement standard (IS) - 2, significantly - BS -1, IS-2, partially -0, do not correspond - 0.

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) It is recommended that individual plans reflect research activities (research topic, programme, publications, conferences, etc.)

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

In the course of the Accreditation of the university, the documentation was studied, interviews were conducted with residents, teaching staff and employers.

In line with the university's mission of "training competitive health care professionals", the admission policy is aimed at selecting the best residents. The university's competitiveness in the educational services market, leading places in the ranking of universities, medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the educational programme in medicine according to national independent rating agencies undoubtedly affect the university's election among residents.

The main method for selecting residents for admission is the results of the competition for the award of State educational grants by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, and the holding of entrance examinations. When admitting to residency, the personal achievements of the applicant, the results of research work, etc. are also taken into account. Duration of study is 2 years.

Residency support and consulting by specialty "Family medicine» is carried out with the direct participation of a teacher or clinical mentor appointed from among the teachers of clinical departments or highly qualified doctors (first and highest category) of the departments of the clinical base, where the training of family medicine residents is carried out.

To provide effective information support for the management of educational activities of the university, the automated information system "Platonus" is used, which informs students about the conduct of the educational process, and also provides the opportunity for electronic interaction with information systems of authorized bodies (UMSHE).

Since 2018, the Department of Informatization and Infrastructure Development has been operating in NJSC "MUK", providing services to students on the principle of "one window".

For the participation of family medicine residents in all treatment activities carried out in clinical bases, a clinical mentor plays an important role. The development of clinical thinking, new knowledge and skills - these are the competencies that are developed during the training of residents at clinical sites. At the Department of Family Medicine, clinical mentors are highly qualified PHC specialists: deputy chief physicians, heads of departments of CFH, GPD of the highest and first categories, which allows them to work effectively and form professional competencies among residents.

Strengths:

- 1) A comprehensive and uniform policy of admission and support of residents is applied
- 2) Student Service Center
- 3) Highly qualified mentors

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Correspond out of 30 standards: completely - basic standard (BS) - 12, improvement standard (IS) - 5, significantly - BS-6, IS-7, partially -0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Document the representation of residents to participate in the development and implementation of a residency programme (for example, a council of residents or other advisory body).

Standard 5: TRAINERS

Hiring, promotion, incentives, dismissals, familiarization of personnel with the rights and obligations are carried out in accordance with the Labor Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Admission to teaching positions at the university is carried out in accordance with the Rules for the admission of employees for employment in NJSC MUK.

The full-time teachers of the Department of Family Medicine - 32 employees, 14 of whom have a scientific degree, 12 - the highest category.

All employees of the department combine the main work at the department with medical work at the bases. In addition, the department has part-time employees - representatives of practical health care, who are mentors.

A teacher who carries out training under the residency programme has an individual plan for working with a resident. The teachers of the department conduct the theoretical part of the lesson (contact hours - 3 hours for a loan), mentors control the practical part of the resident's work (22 hours for a loan).

NJSC "MUK" has developed mechanisms and criteria for systematic assessment of the effectiveness of teachers, developed the level of competence, professional potential of personnel for solving the strategic objectives of the organization, formed plans for the personal growth of employees. The main methods of assessment are the achievement of indicators of the department's activity, attestation of the teaching staff, assignment of a pedagogical category, the management system for the effectiveness of employee activity (EMS), the competition "Best in Profession" for the teaching staff of clinical departments, questioning of students "Teacher through the eyes of students", regular meetings of the rector with the staff of the department ...

Strengths:

- 1) High qualification of the teaching staff of the department
- 2) Involvement of qualified mentors from practical health care in the training of residents
- 3) Active cooperation of teaching staff with Kazakh and international universities
- 4) Creation of conditions for improving the various competencies of teaching staff

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Withcorrespond from 7 standards: completely - basic standard (BS) -4, improvement standard (IS) - 2, significantly - BS -1, IS- 0, partially -0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No recommendation

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

The university has a developed material and technical base for conducting educational and scientific and educational processes. The material and technical base of the university includes: lecture halls, study rooms, educational and research laboratories, a library, information technology facilities, premises for the cultural and social sphere, university clinics.

NJSC "MUK" has a scientific library, which the experts visited on the 1st day of their visit to the university. Library and publishing center with reading rooms and an electronic library hall with a total area of 1394 sq.m., provides library information, publishing and printing products and services for effective information support of the educational process and research activities of the university... Main

fund The Library and Publishing Center has 858805 copies, including 480628 copies of the accredited educational programme. Of these, 254803 in Kazakh, 183691 in Russian.

Clinical bases of the department of family medicine are: clinic of NJSC "MUK", city polyclinics №№ 1, 3, 4, 5, HC PHC, MGB №2, LLP MF "Hippocrat", polyclinics in the suburban areas of Abai, Shakhtinsk, Saran, Balkhash. Residents have access to topical patients, equipment, and the opportunity to improve their skills and competencies. During the visit, the experts visited the city polyclinic # 3, where they had an opportunity to see clearly the conditions for the work of residents.

In addition, the university has a Center for Practical Skills, which the experts visited on the 3rd day of the visit. Residents have the opportunity to improve their practical skills using high-tech simulators.

Thus, the university has a sufficient number of clinical bases and a center for the formation and development of practical skills among residents in accordance with the goals and objectives of the educational programme in the specialty "Family Medicine".

Strengths:

- 1) Availability of highly specialized clinics with sufficient modern equipment
- 2) Rich library fund, ubiquitous access to IT and electronic resources, including international electronic databases of literature
- 3) Resident training in a well-equipped hands-on skills center

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Conforms out of 21 standards: fully-basic standard (BS) - 8, improvement standard (IS) - 4, significantly - BS -2, IS-7, partially -0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No recommendation.

Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION

The assessment of the EP is carried out in accordance with the regulation on <u>Academic Policy</u> of NJSC "MUK".

NJSC "MUK" has developed mechanisms for evaluating educational programmes, providing for the evaluation of programmes at the stages of planning, implementation, analysis of results and implementation of changes, which allows you to monitor the implementation of the educational programme and the progress of students, and ensures the identification and timely solution of emerging problems. The management system of the educational programme of residency in the specialty 7R01124 - "Family Medicine" provides for the participation of all stakeholders, including practical health care, and reflects the responsibility of the management. This is confirmed by the reviews and reviews of employers on the educational programme.

There is a working group for the development and implementation of the EP of residency in the specialty 7R09138 "Family Medicine" at the departments of GMT; suggestions for improvement from teaching staff and residents.

Teachers and residents have the opportunity to participate in the assessment and subsequent improvement of the educational programme on a regular basis through various feedback channels using the questionnaire method.

Independent monitoring of data on the implementation and achievement of final learning outcomes (RO) is carried out by examining EP graduates through the National Center for Independent Examination (NCIE) and by questioning employers.

Strengths:

- 1) Conducting external and internal evaluation of educational programmes
- 2) Engaging independent examiners to assess residents
- 3) Participation of all stakeholders in the assessment and development of educational programmes
 - 4) Feedback through a survey of teaching staff, residents and employers

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Conforms out of 15 standards: completely - basic standard (BS) - 9, improvement standard (IS) - 3, significantly - BS -1, IS-2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No recommendation.

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

According to this standard, confirming data were obtained from interviews with representatives of the administration - the Chairperson of the Board - the rector, vice-rectors for academic work, strategic development and science, clinical work, the head of the Human Resource Management Department.

NJSC "AMU" developed and approved the main internal document defining the scope of duties and powers of the University in relation to EP residency, including the obligation to provide the educational process in full with all the necessary information sources and access to network educational resources - "Academic Policy ". This document is guided by the School of Residency and Professional Development and the department in managing the educational residency programme. The Residency School coordinates the implementation, control and monitoring of the implementation of residency programmes in all licensed specialties.

Other educational, scientific structural divisions are also involved in the process of education and training of residents. The main areas of activity, functions, levels of interaction, the responsibility of these structural divisions, AC well AC the advisory bodies of the university are determined by the current regulation on structural divisions.

For the development of residency programmes, their improvement, representatives of practical health care are involved.

Strengths:

- 1) A clear distribution of responsibilities in the management of the educational process
- 2) Financial well-being of the university
- 3) Partnerships with potential employers and health care organizations

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Conforms out of 15 standards: fully-basic standard (BS) - 8, improvement standard (IS) - 3, significantly - BS-0, IS-4, partially -0, do not correspond - 0. *Standard 8: completed*

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

No recommendation.

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

Due to the fact that this educational programme is new and has not been conducted before, this standard will be considered later in the process of post-accreditation monitoring.

Thus, 8 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and carrying out the examination AC part of the tasks of the external expert evaluation programme were found.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational residency programme in the specialty 7R09138 "Family medicine":

Standard 1

No recommendation

Standard 2

1. Provide in educational programmes for training residents in the management of scientific research, medical statistics, health care organization AC a component of their choice

Standard 3

1. It is recommended that individual plans reflect research activities (research topic, programme, publications, conferences, etc.)

Standard 4

1. Document the representation of residents to participate in the development and implementation of a residency programme (for example, a council of residents or other advisory body)

Standard 5

No recommendation

Standard 6

No recommendation

Standard 7

No recommendation

Standard 8

No recommendation

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the **educational programme in the specialty of residency 7R09138** "Family Medicine» of NJSC "MUK" for a period of 5 years.

Chaiperson

Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna
Foreign expert
Sulaeva Oksana Nikolaevna
Academic expert
Urazova Saltanat Nurguzhaevna
Academic expert
Kurmanova Almagul Medeubayevna
Academic expert
Zhakypbekov Kairat Saparkhanovich
Representative of practical health care
Vitt Svetlana Vladimirovna
Resident Representative
Shaikhina dinara
Student Representative

Iskakova Saltanat Mukhtarovna

Umarova Makpal Aldibekova

ECAQA Observer

De Clarko

A Clarko

A Charles

Attachment 1.

Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) Of educational programme in the specialty of residency 7R09138 "Family Medicine» of NJSC "MUK"

| | | Assessment | | | |
|----------|---|-------------------|---------------------------|---------------------|----------------|
| Standard | Criteria for evaluation | incides | tly ds | compliant | natch |
| Sta | Number of standards = BS * / IS | Totally coincides | Significantly corresponds | Partially compliant | Does not match |
| 1 | MISSION AND END RESULTS 17 = 10/7 | 9/4 | 1/3 | | |
| 2. | EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 30 = 22/8 | 20/5 | 2/3 | | |
| 3. | ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES 11 = 7/4 | 6/2 | 1/2 | | |
| 4 | TRAINEES 30 = 18/12 | 12/5 | 6/7 | | |
| 5 | TRAINERS 7 = 5/2 | 4/2 | 1/0 | | |
| 6. | EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES 21 = 10/11 | 8/4 | 2/7 | | |
| 7. | PROGRAMME EVALUATION 15 = 10/5 | 9/3 | 1/2 | | |
| 8 | GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION 15 = 8/7 | 8/3 | 0/4 | | |
| 9 | CONTINUOUS RENEWAL 4 = 1/3 | - | - | | |
| | Total: 146 = 90/56 | 76/28 | 14/28 | | |
| | | 146 | | | |

^{*} BS - the basic standard must be fulfilled by each medical educational organization, and the fulfillment must be demonstrated during an external assessment of the medical educational and scientific organization.

Attachment 2. List of documents requested by EEC members within the framework of accreditation

| N | Names of documents | number | Date approved |
|-----|---|--------|---------------|
| 0. | | 1 | |
| 1. | Report on the results of assessing students' | 1 | - |
| | satisfaction with the organization of the educational process at NJSC "MUK" for the 2019 - 2020 | | |
| | academic year | | |
| 2. | Science and Health care Journal | 1 | 5 (I) 2019 |
| 3. | Order No. 13/1 of the Dean of the School of | 1 | 07/10/2020 |
| 3. | Residency and Professional Development | 1 | 07/10/2020 |
| 4. | The schedule of lectures, practical classes and the | 1 | |
| ٦. | schedule of the IWST for residents of the II course of | 1 | _ |
| | the 1st stream, studying in the specialty 7R09124 | | |
| | "Family Medicine" for the 2020-2021 academic year | | |
| 5. | The schedule of lectures, practical classes and the | 1 | _ |
| - | schedule of the SSSP for residents of the II course of | | |
| | the 1st stream, studying in the specialty 7R09124 | | |
| | "Family Medicine" for the 2020-2021 academic year | | |
| 6. | Order for hiring part-time job No. 1380 / k | 1 | 09/01/2020 |
| 7. | Order on the appointment of scholarships No. 187 | 1 | 28.08.2019 |
| 8. | The list of elective disciplines (MPE), respectively, | 1 | 08.08.2019 |
| | educational programmes of residency 7R09124 - | | |
| | Family medicine | | |
| 9. | List of clinical mentors in residency for 2020-2021 | 1 | - |
| | 7R09124 - Family medicine | | |
| 10. | Feedback study results for 7R09124 - Family | 1 | 06/18/2020 |
| | Medicine 2019-2020. | | |
| 11. | Certificate for A.D. Abdrakhmanova | 1 | 2020 |
| | Foundation of the First President | | |
| 12. | Certificate of advanced training No. 305 | 1 | 11/13/2020 |
| | Abugalieva Tleuzhan | | |
| 13. | Certificate of continuing education of Begmanova | 1 | 12/25/2020 |
| | B.A. | | |
| 14. | Catalog of elective disciplines for the educational | 1 | 03/12/2020 |
| | programme 7R09124 "Family Medicine" | | |
| 15. | Results of studying feedback in the specialty | 1 | 06/18/2020 |
| | 7R09124 "Family medicine" for 2019-2020yy. | | |
| 16. | Organizational structure of NJSC "MUK" | 1 | 09/30/2020 |
| 17. | Educational programme in the specialty "7R09124- | 1 | 06/27/2019 |
| | Family Medicine" | | |
| 18. | Reviews from experts to the educational programme | 1 | |
| | in the specialty "7R09124-Family Medicine" | | |
| 19. | Syllabus modulo "Family Medicine" | 1 | |